

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
September, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)

County Councillors: J. Becker, L. Brown, D. Dovey, R. Harris,
J. Higginson, G. Howard, M. Powell and A. Webb

County Councillor M. Groucutt attended the meeting by invitation of
the Chair.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Mark Hand	Head of Place-making, Housing, Highways and Flood
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Craig O'Connor	Development Management Area Team Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Kate Bingham	Senior Development Management Officer
Louise Corbett	Strategy & Policy Officer - Affordable Housing
Denzil – John Turbervill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

County Councillors: P. Clarke, A. Davies, D. Evans, M. Feakins and P. Murphy

1. Declarations of Interest

There were no declarations of interest made by Members.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting held on 6th August 2019 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

3. Application DC/2016/01342 - Proposed conversion, extension and mansard roof extension of the property to form 21 residential units with onsite cycle and vehicular parking, refuse and amenity facilities. Newbridge House Tudor Street Abergavenny Monmouthshire NP7 5DH

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Grofield ward had been unable to attend the Planning Committee meeting. However, her observations in respect of the application were outlined in late correspondence and highlighted by the Development Management Area Manager presenting the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

In light of the late correspondence received by the Department for Work and Pensions, and the consideration for compliance with Policy E1, it was recommended that the application be deferred to review the officer recommendation.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were made:

- The Business Insights Manager had raised similar concerns to the Department for Work and Pensions (DWP).
- Concern was expressed regarding the lack of parking provision.
- The Highways Department had objected to the application.
- Concern was expressed regarding whether the site was a sustainable location.
- The height and design of the application were a concern and considered to be inappropriate.
- The parking requirements are more in line with its use as a job centre as opposed to its use as residential accommodation.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that consideration of application DC/2016/01342 be deferred to a future Planning Committee meeting to re-consider the officer recommendation in light of recent evidence regarding the continued employment use of the property and Local Development Plan Policy E1.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

In favour of deferral	-	9
Against deferral	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/01342 be deferred to a future Planning Committee meeting to re-consider the officer recommendation in light of recent evidence regarding the continued employment use of the property and Local Development Plan Policy E1.

4. Application DM/2019/00346 - Application for the approval of reserved matters (appearance, scale, layout and landscaping) for the development of 106 residential dwellings pursuant to outline permission DC/2016/00880. Orchard Lea, Gypsy Lane, Llanfoist

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

The local Member for Llanfoist, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- Concern was expressed regarding the status of the pedestrian links on the plans, in particular to the north western boundary of the site. This is not a path that is used frequently. If this is to be a viable and regularly used path, regular maintenance of the path will need to be undertaken.
- The siting of the coach house in the middle of the courtyard / parking area is considered to be inappropriate and a request was made for this to be revised.
- Concern was expressed regarding the use of Gypsy Lane with regard to excessive speed of traffic along this route. This route is already used extensively as a route to the south. Concern was expressed that there has not been any direct mitigation identifying how the Section 106 agreement might address this issue.
- The local Member asked that the Committee grants consent to consider removing the parts of class A to side extensions on plots where there is tandem parking to the side of a dwelling.
- Concern was expressed that the mass of the western cottages was excessive. This issue could be looked at again with agreement of the Delegation Panel.

In response to the issues raised by the local Member, the Head of Placemaking, Housing, Highways and Flood provided the Committee with the following information:

- Outline planning consent had been granted. The reserved matters had been presented to Committee for consideration.
- An existing public right of way runs along the rear of the development. There are no changes proposed to the right of way except for a link being created from the proposed development to improve connectivity.

The Development Services Manager provided the Committee with the following information:

- In terms of design, the Coach House and western terrace could be reviewed.
- With regard to permitted development rights, a condition could be added that the parking areas should be retained for parking provision which would prevent properties being extended onto these parking spaces.
- As this is a reserved matters application, vehicle use and traffic speeds along the B road cannot be considered as the principle of development has already been agreed. The Highways Department could look onto this matter outside of the scope of the application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

In considering the application the following points were noted:

- It was considered that there was a need to reduce the speed limit along the length of Gypsy Lane.
- The terrace needs to be redesigned.
- Bus stop provision had been considered at the outline planning application.
- Electric charging points would have had to have been undertaken at the outline planning application stage via a Section 106 agreement.
- The fake chimneys make it more difficult to incorporate solar harvesting on the roofs. Protection of the fake chimneys would be detrimental to solar harvesting opportunities.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/00346 be approved subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition to ensure parking spaces are retained at all times for parking use. Also, the long terrace be re-designed, the coach house unit in the parking court be reviewed and consideration be given to the removal of the fake chimneys. These amendments to be presented to the Delegation Panel for approval.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposition	-	8
Against the proposition	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00346 be approved subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition to ensure parking spaces are retained at all times for parking use. Also, the long terrace be re designed, the coach house unit in the parking court be reviewed and consideration be given to the removal of the fake chimneys. These amendments to be presented to the Delegation Panel for approval.

5. Application DM/2019/00603 - Erection of a two-storey dwelling house. Land between Chapel Cottage and Gower Cottage, Glyn View, Tintern

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 15 conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for St. Arvans, also a Planning Committee Member, was pleased with the number of conditions and informative notifications in respect of the application.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor A. Webb and seconded by County Councillor D. Dovey that application DM/2019/00603 be approved subject to the 15 conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	9
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00603 be approved subject to the 15 conditions, as outlined in the report.

6. Application DM/2019/00796 - Retention of existing buildings and amendments to roof structure and external elevations. Land At Bridge House, A48 Chepstow Garden Centre to Pwllmeyric Hill, Pwllmeyric

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Shirenewton, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- The development has not been built to approved plans. The local Member thanked the Planning Officer for liaising with the applicant to make appropriate changes to improve the development making it more compatible with the existing street scene.
- One of the garages is not located in an ideal place. However, even if it were moved further forward it would not make a significant difference to the dwelling itself.
- In terms of the garages, the local Member is pleased that there is a condition in place to retain the garages in perpetuity.
- The local Member raised questions regarding the status of the garages in the original application and also regarding the materials to be agreed and the type of render being used.

Having received the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, the following points were noted:

- It was considered that the properties and one of the garages were acceptable. However, the other garage was unacceptable.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- The Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that the height of the garage in the current application was lower than the garage which had been originally approved.
- The type of render to be used could be agreed via the Delegation Panel or a condition could be set.
- The parking provision had not previously been conditioned on the previous consent. It was in accordance with the approved plans. However, this could be conditioned as remaining as parking provision in perpetuity.
- The local Member stated that the garages would be constructed from stone with the houses being constructed with stone and render, preferably soft render to remain in keeping with the street scene. A condition should be added to the original application with regard to the parking places.
- There was support for the Planning Officers in achieving the changes to the application. However, there were concerns regarding the location of one of the garages.
- The Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that the height of the dwellings are lower than previously approved. Garages have previously been approved on this site which are higher than is currently being considered. The garages have less of an impact than previously approved.
- One of the garages is considered to be in the wrong orientation when driving into the site.
- In response to comments made, the Head of Placemaking, Housing, Highways and Flood stated that the application cannot be refused as it is not per the original plans. It can only be refused if it is considered that there is material harm being caused by what is now being proposed.
- It was suggested that consideration of the application be deferred to allow the Highways Department to investigate whether the changes are appropriate to allow vehicles leaving the garages to join the highway in a forward gear.
- It was considered that, in its current form, the relationship of the garages to the house and the street scene is detrimental in terms of appearance and character. It was suggested that the Committee could vote on whether to approve the houses. Followed by a vote to consider refusal of the garages.
- The Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that the access arrangement is the same as was originally approved by Planning Committee. The local community had asked for the boundary wall to be reduced from two metres to one metre. Therefore, making the garages more visually prominent. The visibility splays have also been improved. Parking and turning provision remains the same as previously agreed by the Planning Committee.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- The local Member stated that it would be preferable to have the garages rather than have a one metre wall.

It was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that a split decision be considered for the retention of the houses but not for the retention of the garages.

Proposal: retention of the houses:

In favour of the proposal	-	8
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

Proposal: Reconsider with the applicant the orientation, footprint and highways issues relating to the garages:

In favour of the proposal	-	4
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	5

The proposition was carried.

A vote was undertaken for Planning Officers to liaise with the applicant regarding the garages. The Planning Committee resolved by a majority vote to undertake this proposal.

We resolved to defer consideration of application DM/2019/00796 to the next Planning Committee meeting. The revised house designs are acceptable but require the applicant to re-consider the garages by reducing the footprints and to consider re-orientating the roof lines.

7. Application DM/2019/01032 - Domestic garage on previously approved site. Hillcrest, 14 Lansdown Road ,Abergavenny, NP7 6AN

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Lansdown ward attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- This is the third application for the site.
- The first application had been refused on the grounds of overdevelopment.
- The second application had been approved as it had been a scaled back application with a condition that future permitted development rights be removed.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

- The current application aims to overcome this and defies the approval previously granted by Planning Committee.
- The dates on the plan for the garage are of the same time when Planning Committee previously granted planning permission in respect of future development on this site.
- It is considered to be growth on the site by stealth, being the third application for the same plot.
- The local Member quoted the decision made by Planning Committee in respect of the second application which had been approved which stated that there would be no enlargements, improvements or other alterations to the dwelling or any outbuildings shall be erected or constructed. If substantial extensions or alterations were necessary this development would not normally be considered. It was considered that this information was contrary to the current application.
- The Planning Committee should stand by the decision that had previously been made in respect of this dwelling and consider refusing the current application.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, the following points were noted:

- The application is not harmful to the site and setting with no immediate dwellings being located nearby that might be affected by a dwelling of this scale.
- The purpose of the condition of the previous application was to remove permitted development rights to prevent up to 50% of the curtilage to be covered with outbuildings.
- The design of the current application is pleasant and the plot is large enough for the proposed development.

It was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2019/01032 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	8
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01032 be approved subject to the five conditions, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
September, 2019 at 2.00 pm

8. Application DM/2019/01069 - Workshop extension to existing garage. 7 Graig View, Cross Ash, Abergavenny, NP7 8PG

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor J. Higginson that application DM/2019/01069 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	9
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01069 be approved subject to the two conditions, as outlined in the report.

9. Amending Affordable Housing Financial Contributions in Accordance with the Adopted Revised Affordable Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) (July 2019)

We received a report regarding amended affordable housing contribution figures as outlined in Appendix 1 of the report, in accordance with the adopted Affordable Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) (July 2019).

In doing so, the following points were noted:

- The financial contributions do not relate to onsite provision. This relates to seeking a financial contribution towards affordable housing provision. The information in the report refers to applications that are currently in the system with regard to legal agreements to be processed.
- Where there is a formula, these applications are for outline planning permission only. Therefore, the exact floor space of the dwellings is not yet known. The formula will be put into the Section 106 agreement. When the reserved matters application is submitted at a later date, the exact floor space of the dwellings can be identified which will help to identify the financial contribution.
- The formula for calculating the new financial contribution is:

Financial Contribution = Internal Floor Area (m²) x CIL Rate x 58%.

This refers to all internal floor space of the dwelling including hallways, stairs and any attached garages and not just the footprint of the building.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
September, 2019 at 2.00 pm**

We resolved to approve the amended affordable housing financial contributions as outlined within Appendix 1 of the report in accordance with the adopted Affordable Housing SPG (July 2019).

10. Tree Preservation Order Appeal Decision 11 Chapel Mead, Penperlleni, Goytre

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 5th August 2019. Site address: 11 Chapel Mead, Penperlleni, Goytre.

We noted that the appeal decision had been dismissed.

11. New Appeals Received 20th June to 20th August 2019

We noted the list of appeals received between 20th June and 20th August 2019.

The meeting ended at 4.04 pm.